

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

STATE OF ALABAMA, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT
OF COMMERCE, et al.,

Defendants,

DIANA MARTINEZ, et al.,

Defendant-Intervenors,

and

COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA,
CALIFORNIA, et al.,

Defendant-Intervenors.

Case No.: 2:18-cv-00772-RDP

MOVANTS' PROPOSED ANSWER AND DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFFS' COMPLAINT

The State of New York; State of California; State of Colorado; State of Connecticut; District of Columbia; State of Illinois; Commonwealth of Massachusetts; State of Minnesota; State of Nevada; State of New Jersey; State of New Mexico; State of Oregon; State of Rhode Island; State of Vermont; Commonwealth of Virginia; State of Washington; Cameron County, Texas; Central Falls, Rhode Island; Chicago, Illinois; Hidalgo County, Texas; Monterey County, California; New York, New York; Philadelphia, Pennsylvania; Providence, Rhode Island; Seattle, Washington; and the United States Conference of Mayors (collectively, the “Proposed Defendant-Intervenors”) hereby submit their Answer and Defenses to Plaintiffs’ Complaint (Doc. # 1) as follows:

INTRODUCTION

1. Deny the allegations of the first two sentences of paragraph 1 of the Complaint, and respectfully refer the Court to the Federal Register as the best statement of the referenced provisions.¹ Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of the last sentence of paragraph 1.
2. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 2 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the United States Constitution and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.
3. Deny the allegations of paragraph 3 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the U.S. Constitution and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

¹ Throughout, where the Complaint refers to “illegal aliens,” the Proposed Defendant-Intervenors will use the term “undocumented immigrants.”

4. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 4 of the Complaint as they are limited to characterizations of the instant action and legal conclusions to which no response is required. Admit that Plaintiffs seek the relief described in the second sentence of paragraph 4 of the Complaint but deny that that they are entitled to such relief, and neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the U.S. Constitution and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

5. Admit that Plaintiffs seek the relief described in paragraph 5 of the Complaint but deny that they are entitled to such relief, and neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 5 of the Complaint insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statutes and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

6. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 6 of the Complaint insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

7. Admit that Plaintiffs seek the relief described in paragraph 7 of the Complaint but deny that they are entitled to such relief, and neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 7 of the Complaint insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

8. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 8 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required. Admit the allegations of the second sentence of paragraph 8 of the Complaint. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of the third sentence of paragraph 8 of the Complaint.

9. Admit that Plaintiffs seek the relief described in paragraph 9 of the Complaint but deny that they are entitled to such relief, and neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 9 of the Complaint insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

THE PARTIES

1. Admit the allegations in the first sentence of the second paragraph 1 of the Complaint. Neither admit nor deny the remaining allegations of the second paragraph 1 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.²
2. Admit the allegations of the first two sentences of the second paragraph 2 of the Complaint, except deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to Representative Brooks' voter registration. Deny the allegations of the third sentence of the second paragraph 2 of the Complaint.

3. Admit the allegations of the second paragraph 3 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

4. Admit the allegations of the second paragraph 4 of the Complaint.
5. Admit the allegations of the second paragraph 5 of the Complaint.
6. Admit the allegations of the second paragraph 6 of the Complaint.

ALLEGATIONS

7. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of the second paragraph 7 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

² As the numbering of the paragraphs of the Complaint restarts at 1 at the beginning of the section headed "The Parties," the paragraphs of this Answer are numbered to correspond.

8. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of the second paragraph 8 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

9. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of the second paragraph 9 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

10. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 10 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

11. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 11 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

12. Deny the allegations of paragraph 12 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

13. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 13 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

14. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 14 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

15. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 15 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

16. Admit the allegations of paragraph 16 of the Complaint.

17. Deny the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 17 of the Complaint.

Neither admit nor deny the allegations of the second sentence of paragraph 17 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

18. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 18 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

19. Admit the allegations of paragraph 19 of the Complaint.

20. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 20 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

21. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 21 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

22. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 22 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

23. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 23 of the Complaint.

24. Admit the allegations of paragraph 24 of the Complaint except affirmatively aver that Defendant Ross's memorandum announcing the decision to ask a question regarding citizenship status on the 2020 Census was dated March 26, 2018.

25. Admit the allegations of paragraph 25 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

26. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 26 of the Complaint.

27. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of Paragraph 27 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

28. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of Paragraph 28 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

29. Deny the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 29 of the Complaint as it is vaguely and ambiguously stated. Admit the remaining allegations of paragraph 29 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

30. Deny the allegations of the first and third sentences of paragraph 30 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated. Admit the remaining allegations of paragraph 30 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise

deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

31. Admit the allegations of paragraph 31 of the Complaint.

32. Admit the allegations of the first two sentences of paragraph 32 of the Complaint.

Neither admit nor deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 32 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

33. Deny the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 33 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, but affirmatively aver that undocumented immigrants are not uniformly distributed within the United States. Admit the allegations of the second sentence of paragraph 33 of the Complaint.

34. Admit the allegations of paragraph 34 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

35. Admit the allegations of paragraph 35 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

36. Admit the allegations of paragraph 36 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

37. Deny the allegations of paragraph 37 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

38. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 38 of the Complaint insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, except admit that the number of electors to which a state is entitled in the Electoral College is partially determined by the size of its congressional delegation.

39. Admit the allegations of paragraph 39 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

40. Admit the allegations of paragraph 40 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

41. Deny the allegations of paragraph 41 of the Complaint.

42. Deny the allegations of paragraph 42 of the Complaint and respectfully refer the Court to the documents cited as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

43. Admit the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 43 of the Complaint. Deny the remaining allegations of paragraph 43 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

44. Deny the allegations of paragraph 44 of the Complaint.

45. Admit the allegations of paragraph 45 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

46. Deny the allegations of paragraph 46 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

47. Deny the allegations of paragraph 47 of the Complaint and respectfully refer the Court to the cited documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

48. Deny the allegations of paragraph 48 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required.

49. Deny the allegations of paragraph 49 of the Complaint.

50. Deny the allegations of paragraph 50 of the Complaint, except deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to whether Alabama will lose a seat in the House of Representatives if all persons resident in the United States are enumerated for apportionment purposes as required by the United States Constitution.

51. Deny the allegations of paragraph 51 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the accuracy of the proposed method.

52. Admit the allegations of paragraph 52 of the Complaint and respectfully refer the Court to the case cited as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

53. Admit the allegations of paragraph 53 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

54. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of Paragraph 54 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions to which no response is required, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

55. Admit the allegations of Paragraph 55 of the Complaint.

56. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 56 of the Complaint.

57. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 57 of the Complaint.

58. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 58 of the Complaint.

59. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 59 of the Complaint.

60. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of the first sentence of paragraph 60 of the Complaint. Deny the allegations of the second sentence of paragraph 60 of the Complaint.

61. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 61 of the Complaint.

62. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 62 of the Complaint.

63. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 63 of the Complaint.

64. Deny the allegations of paragraph 64 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

65. Deny the allegations of paragraph 65 of the Complaint and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

66. Deny the allegations of paragraph 66 of the Complaint and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

67. Deny the allegations of paragraph 67 of the Complaint, deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

68. Deny the allegations of paragraph 68 of the Complaint and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

69. Deny the allegations of paragraph 69 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

70. Deny the allegations of paragraph 70 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

71. Deny the allegations of paragraph 71 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

72. Deny the allegations of paragraph 72 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response, and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the source or reliability of the population estimate therein.

73. Deny the allegations of paragraph 73 of the Complaint.

74. Admit the allegations of the first two sentences of paragraph 74 of the Complaint. Deny the allegations of the third sentence of paragraph 74 of the Complaint.

75. Admit the allegations of paragraph 75 of the Complaint and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

76. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 76 of the Complaint.

77. Admit the allegations of paragraph 77 of the Complaint and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

78. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 78 of the Complaint.

79. Admit the allegations of paragraph 79 of the Complaint and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

80. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 80 of the Complaint.

81. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 81 of the Complaint.

82. Admit the allegations of paragraph 82 of the Complaint.

83. Deny the allegations of paragraph 83 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated, and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the accuracy of those allegations as a representation of the referenced estimate.

84. Admit the allegations of paragraph 84 of the Complaint.

85. Deny the allegations of paragraph 85 of the Complaint and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the details of how non-governmental organizations will distribute funds in the future.

86. Deny the allegations of paragraph 86 of the Complaint and deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the details of how non-governmental organizations will distribute funds in the future.

87. Deny the allegations of paragraph 87 of the Complaint except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the U.S. Constitution, statute, and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

88. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 88 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

89. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 89 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

90. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 90 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

91. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 91 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the case cited as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

92. Deny the allegations of paragraph 92 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

93. Deny the allegations of paragraph 93 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

94. Deny the allegations of paragraph 94 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response, and

respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provisions of the U.S. Constitution and the cited case as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

95. Deny the allegations of paragraph 95 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

96. Deny the allegations of paragraph 96 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response, and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

97. Deny the allegations of paragraph 97 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

98. Deny the allegations of paragraph 98 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

99. Deny the allegations of paragraph 99 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

100. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 100 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

101. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 101 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

102. Deny the allegations of paragraph 102 of the Complaint as they are vaguely and ambiguously stated.

103. Admit the allegations of paragraph 103 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

104. Deny the allegations of paragraph 104 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

105. Deny the allegations of paragraph 105 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

106. Deny the allegations of paragraph 106 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

107. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 107 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

108. Deny the allegations of paragraph 108 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

109. Deny the allegations of paragraph 109 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

110. Deny the allegations of paragraph 110 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

111. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 111 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

112. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 112 of the Complaint as it consists of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

113. Deny the allegations of paragraph 113 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

114. Deny the allegations of paragraph 114 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

115. Deny the allegations of paragraph 115 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response

116. Deny the allegations of paragraph 116 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response

117. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 117 of the Complaint.

118. Deny knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations of paragraph 118 of the Complaint.

119. Deny the allegations of paragraph 119 of the Complaint.

120. Deny the allegations of paragraph 120 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response.

121. Deny the allegations of paragraph 121 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

122. Deny the allegations of paragraph 122 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

123. Deny the allegations of paragraph 123 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

124. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 124 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

125. Deny the allegations of paragraph 125 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

126. Deny the allegations of paragraph 126 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and

respectfully refer the Court to the cited case and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

127. Deny the allegations of paragraph 127 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case and the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

128. Deny the allegations of paragraph 128 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

129. Admit the allegations of the first four sentences of paragraph 129 of the Complaint insofar as they are consistent with the documents cited, otherwise deny those allegations, and respectfully refer the Court to those documents as the best statement of their contents and meaning. Deny the allegations of the fifth and sixth sentences of paragraph 129 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case and to the referenced regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

130. Deny the allegations of paragraph 130 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

131. Deny the allegations of paragraph 131 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

132. Deny the allegations of paragraph 132 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

133. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 133 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

134. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 134 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

135. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 135 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the cited case as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

136. Deny the allegations of paragraph 136 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute and provisions of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

137. Deny the allegations of paragraph 137 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

138. Deny the allegations of paragraph 138 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and

respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

139. Deny the allegations of paragraph 139 of the Complaint.

FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION

Violation of the Fourteenth Amendment (Congressional Apportionment)

140. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors repeat and reassert their responses to Paragraphs 1–9 and 1–139 as though fully set forth herein.

141. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 141 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

142. Deny the allegations of paragraph 142 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION

Violation of the Fourteenth Amendment, Article I, § 2, and Article II, § 1 (Electoral College Apportionment)

143. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors repeat and reassert their responses to Paragraphs 1–9 and 1–142 as though fully set forth herein.

144. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 144 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

145. Deny the allegations of paragraph 145 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and

respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION

Violation of Article I, § 2 (Actual Enumeration)

146. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors repeat and reassert their responses to Paragraphs 1–9 and 1–145 as though fully set forth herein.

147. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 147 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

148. Deny the allegations of paragraph 148 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced provision of the U.S. Constitution and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION

Violation of the APA (Arbitrary and Capricious)

149. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors repeat and reassert their responses to Paragraphs 1–9 and 1–148 as though fully set forth herein.

150. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 150 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

151. Deny the allegations of paragraph 151 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

152. Deny the allegations of paragraph 152 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION

Violation of the APA (Contrary to Law)

153. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors repeat and reassert their responses to Paragraphs 1–9 and 1–152 as though fully set forth herein.

154. Neither admit nor deny the allegations of paragraph 154 of the Complaint as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statute as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

155. Deny the allegations of paragraph 155 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statutes as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

156. Deny the allegations of paragraph 156 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced regulation as the best statement of its contents and meaning.

157. Deny the allegations of paragraph 157 of the Complaint, except neither admit nor deny those allegations insofar as they consist of legal conclusions requiring no response and respectfully refer the Court to the referenced statutes and regulation as the best statement of their contents and meaning.

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

158. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors assert the following affirmative defenses, which apply to each and every cause of action asserted in the Complaint to which such defense may be applicable. By virtue of alleging these further defenses, Proposed Defendant-Intervenors do not assume any burden of proof, persuasion, or production not otherwise legally assigned to them.

159. Except as otherwise specifically stated above, Proposed Defendant-Intervenors deny each and every allegation contained in the Complaint.

160. Plaintiffs are not entitled to any relief as to any of the Counts set forth in the Complaint.

161. Plaintiffs' Complaint fails in whole or in part to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.

162. This Court lacks subject matter jurisdiction over Plaintiffs' claims because Plaintiffs cannot demonstrate injury-in-fact, traceability, or redressability as necessary to assert standing.

163. Plaintiffs' claims are barred in whole or in part by the doctrine of laches.

164. Plaintiffs' claims are waived for failure to present them to the Commerce Department or Census Bureau during public comment on the proposed Residence Rule.

RESERVATION OF DEFENSES

165. Proposed Defendant-Intervenors reserve the right to amend this Answer and to assert additional defenses or to supplement, alter, or edit this Answer, or to assert any counterclaims.

WHEREFORE, Proposed Defendant-Intervenors pray for judgment as follows:

1. That Plaintiffs' claims be dismissed with prejudice in their entirety;
2. That judgment be entered in favor of Proposed Defendant-Intervenors;

3. For such other and further relief as the Court deems just and proper.

DATED: August 12, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General of the State of New York

/s/ Joyce White Vance
Joyce White Vance
101 Paul W. Bryant Drive
Tuscaloosa, AL 35487
jvance@law.ua.edu

/s/ Barry A. Ragsdale
Barry A. Ragsdale
SIROTE & PERMUTT, PC
2311 Highland Avenue South
Birmingham, AL 35205
Phone: (205) 930-5100
Fax: (205) 930-5101
bragsdale@sirote.com

XAVIER BECERRA
Attorney General of California

/s/ Gabrielle D. Boutin
Gabrielle D. Boutin*
Deputy Attorney General
Anthony R. Hakl
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
R. Matthew Wise, *Deputy Attorney General*
California Department of Justice
1300 I Street, Suite 125
P.O. Box 944255
Sacramento, CA 94244-2550
Phone: (916) 210-6053
Gabrielle.Boutin@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for the State of California

By: /s/ Matthew Colangelo
Matthew Colangelo*
Chief Counsel for Federal Initiatives
Elena Goldstein,* *Senior Trial Counsel*
Elizabeth Morgan*
Assistant Attorney General
Ajay Saini,* *Assistant Attorney General*
Office of the New York State Attorney General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
Phone: (212) 416-6057
Matthew.Colangelo@ag.ny.gov

Attorneys for the State of New York

PHILIP J. WEISER
Attorney General of the State of Colorado

Eric R. Olson, *Solicitor General*
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor
Denver, CO 80203
Phone: (720) 508-6548
eric.olson@coag.gov

Attorneys for the State of Colorado

WILLIAM TONG
Attorney General of Connecticut

Mark F. Kohler, *Assistant Attorney General*
Office of the Attorney General
55 Elm Street
P.O. Box 120
Hartford, CT 06106
Phone: (860) 808-5020
Mark.Kohler@ct.gov

Attorneys for the State of Connecticut

KARL A. RACINE
Attorney General for the District of Columbia

Valerie M. Nannery
Assistant Attorney General
Public Advocacy Division
Office of the Attorney General for
the District of Columbia
441 4th Street, N.W., Suite 630 South
Washington, DC 20001
Phone: (202) 724-6610
valerie.nannery@dc.gov

Attorneys for the District of Columbia

KWAME RAOUL
Attorney General of the State of Illinois

Jeff VanDam, *Public Interest Counsel*
Office of the Illinois Attorney General
100 West Randolph Street, 12th Floor
Chicago, IL 60601
Phone: (312) 814-1188
JVanDam@atg.state.il.us

Attorneys for the State of Illinois

MAURA HEALEY
Attorney General of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts

By: /s/ Ann E. Lynch
Ann E. Lynch,* *Assistant Attorney General*
Miranda Cover,* *Assistant Attorney General*
Public Protection & Advocacy Bureau
Massachusetts Attorney General's Office
One Ashburton Place
Boston, MA 02108
Phone: (617) 727-2200
Ann.lynch@mass.gov

Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts

KEITH ELLISON
Attorney General of the State of Minnesota

Jacob Campion, *Assistant Attorney General*
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1100
St. Paul, MN 55101-2128
Phone: (651) 757-1459
jacob.campion@ag.state.mn.us

Attorneys for the State of Minnesota

AARON D. FORD
Attorney General of the State of Nevada

Heidi Parry Stern, *Solicitor General*
Office of the Nevada Attorney General
555 E. Washington Ave., Ste. 3900
Las Vegas, NV 89101
Phone: (775) 684-1100
HStern@ag.nv.gov

Attorneys for the State of Nevada

GURBIR S. GREWAL
Attorney General of the State of New Jersey

Glenn J. Moramarco
Assistant Attorney General
Katherine A. Gregory
Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Richard J. Hughes Justice Complex
25 Market Street, 8th Floor, West Wing
Trenton, NJ 08625-0080
Phone: (609) 292-4925
Glenn.Moramarco@law.njoag.gov

Attorneys for the State of New Jersey

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
Attorney General of the State of Oregon

Nicole deFever
Scott Kaplan
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Oregon Department of Justice
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301
Phone: (971) 673-1800
Nicole.defever@doj.state.or.us

Attorneys for the State of Oregon

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.
Attorney General of the State of Vermont

Benjamin D. Battles, *Solicitor General*
Julio A. Thompson
Assistant Attorney General, Civil Rights Unit
Office of the Vermont Attorney General
109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609-1001
Phone: (802) 828-5500
Benjamin.Battles@vermont.gov

Attorneys for the State of Vermont

HECTOR BALDERAS
Attorney General of New Mexico

Tania Maestas
Chief Deputy Attorney General
Nicholas M. Sydow, *Civil Appellate Chief Bureau Chief, Civil Rights Bureau*
Jennie Lusk
408 Galisteo Street
Santa Fe, NM 87501
Phone: (505) 490-4060
tmaestas@nmag.gov

Attorneys for the State of New Mexico

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General of the State of Rhode Island

Justin Sullivan
Special Assistant Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
Phone: (401) 274-4400
jjsullivan@riag.ri.gov

Attorneys for the State of Rhode Island

MARK R. HERRING
Attorney General of the Commonwealth of Virginia

Michelle S. Kallen, *Deputy Solicitor General*
Toby J. Heytens, *Solicitor General*
Martine E. Cicconi, *Deputy Solicitor General*
Brittany M. Jones, *John Marshall Fellow*
Office of the Attorney General
202 North Ninth Street
Richmond, VA 23219
Phone: (804) 786-7240
SolicitorGeneral@oag.state.va.us

Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Virginia

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
Attorney General of the State of Washington

Laura K. Clinton, *Assistant Attorney General*
Andrew R. W. Hughes
 Assistant Attorney General
Complex Litigation Division
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
Seattle, WA 98104
Phone: (206) 233-3383
LauraC5@atg.wa.gov

Attorneys for the State of Washington

MARK A. FLESSNER
Corporation Counsel of the City of Chicago

Stephen Kane, *Deputy Corporation Counsel*
Rebecca Hirsch, *Assistant Corporation Counsel*
City of Chicago Law Department
Affirmative Litigation Division
121 N. LaSalle Street, Room 600
Chicago, IL 60602
Phone: (312) 744-6934
Stephen.kane@cityofchicago.org

Attorneys for the City of Chicago

MARCEL S. PRATT
City Solicitor of the City of Philadelphia

Benjamin H. Field
 Divisional Deputy City Solicitor
City of Philadelphia Law Department
1515 Arch Street, 17th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102
Phone: (215) 683-5003
marcel.pratt@phila.gov

Attorneys for the City of Philadelphia

MATTHEW JERZYK
City Solicitor for the City of Central Falls
City of Central Falls

580 Broad Street
Central Falls, RI 02863
Phone: (401) 727-7422
MJerzyk@CentralFallsRI.us

Attorney for the City of Central Falls

ZACHARY W. CARTER
Corporation Counsel of the City of New York

Tonya Jenerette
 Deputy Chief for Strategic Litigation
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
Phone: (212) 356-4055
tjeneret@law.nyc.gov

Attorneys for the City of New York

JEFFREY DANA
City Solicitor of the City of Providence
City of Providence
444 Westminster Street
Providence, RI 02903
Phone: (401) 680-5333
Jdana@providdenceri.gov

Attorney for the City of Providence

PETER S. HOLMES
Seattle City Attorney

Gary T. Smith, *Assistant City Attorney*
Erica R. Franklin, *Assistant City Attorney*
701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2050
Seattle, WA 98104-7097
Phone: (206) 684-8200
Gary.Smith@seattle.gov

Attorneys for the City of Seattle

CHARLES J. MCKEE
Monterey County Counsel

William M. Litt, *Deputy County Counsel*
Office of the County Counsel
County of Monterey
168 West Alisal Street, 3rd Floor
Salinas, CA 93901
Phone: (831) 755-5045
McKeeCJ@co.monterey.ca.us

Attorneys for Monterey County

ROLANDO L. RIOS
Special Counsel for Cameron and Hidalgo Counties

110 Broadway, Suite 355
San Antonio, TX 78205
Phone: (210) 222-2102
rios@rolandorioslaw.com

Attorney for Cameron County, Texas and Hidalgo County, Texas

UNITED STATES CONFERENCE OF MAYORS

John Daniel Reaves, *General Counsel*
U.S. Conference of Mayors
1750 K Street NW, 11th Floor
Washington, DC 20006
Phone: (202) 887-1100
jdreavesoffice@gmail.com

Attorney for the U.S. Conference of Mayors

*Application for admission pro hac vice forthcoming